

No 467982

FRENCH REPUBLIC

MUNICIPALITY OF GRANDE-SYNTHÉ
and others

ON BEHALF OF THE FRENCH PEOPLE

Mr Cédric Fraisseix

Reporting Judge (Rapporteur)

The Conseil d'État, ruling as the Supreme Administrative
Court
(Litigation Section, 6th and 5th Chambers combined)

Mr Nicolas Agnoux
Consultant Judge (Rapporteur public)

Based on the report of the 6th Chamber
of the Litigation Section

Session of 10 October 2025
Decision of 24 October 2025

Having regard to the following proceedings:

By decision no 427301 of 1 July 2021, the Conseil d'État, ruling as the Supreme Administrative Court, firstly quashed as ultra vires the implicit refusal of the President of the French Republic, the Prime Minister and the Minister for the Ecological and Inclusive Transition of the request by the municipality of Grande-Synthe to take all useful measures to curb the greenhouse gas emissions produced in France in order to ensure compatibility with the greenhouse gas emission reduction targets set by Article L. 100-4 of the French Energy Code and Annex I of Regulation (EU) 2018/842 of 30 May 2018 on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030 contributing to climate action to meet commitments under the 2015 Paris Agreement, and secondly, ordered the Prime Minister to take such measures before 31 March 2022.

By decision no 467982 of 10 May 2023, the Conseil d'État, ruling as the Supreme Administrative Court on applications from the municipality of Grande-Synthe, the City of Paris and the associations Notre affaire à tous, Oxfam France, Fondation pour la nature et l'homme and Greenpeace France, firstly ordered the Prime Minister to take all useful supplementary measures to ensure that the pace of reduction of greenhouse gas emissions is consistent with the trajectory for reducing these emissions specified in Decree no 2020-457 of 21 April 2020 with a view to meeting reduction targets set by Article L. 100-4 of the Energy Code and by Annex I to Regulation (EU) 2018/842 of 30 May 2018 before 30 June 2024, and to produce, by 31 December 2023, then at the latest by 30 June 2024, all the elements proving the adoption of these measures and enabling the assessment of their impact on these greenhouse gas

emission reduction targets, and secondly, dismissed the submissions seeking the imposition of a penalty.

By letter dated 27 December 2023, the Conseil d'État's Report, Studies and Cooperation Section officer responsible for enforcing court decisions asked the Minister for Ecological Transition and Territorial Cohesion to justify the additional measures taken to enforce the rulings of 1st July 2021 and 10 May 2023 and to enable their assessment.

By observations registered on 30 and 31 December 2023 and also on 29 June and 8 July 2024, the Minister for Ecological Transition and Territorial Cohesion provided details of the measures adopted to this end.

The Conseil d'État's Report, Studies and Cooperation Section carried out the procedures provided for by the French Code of Administrative Justice, and on 20 November 2024, the President of this Section sent the President of the 6th Chamber of the Litigation Section a memorandum setting out the measures taken by the State and assessing the implementation of the Conseil d'État rulings of 1st July 2021 and 10 May 2023.

The aforementioned memorandum of 20 November 2024 was sent to the parties pursuant to the provisions of Article R. 931-5 of the French Code of Administrative Justice.

By a statement of case registered on 5 March 2025, the associations Notre affaire à tous, Oxfam France, and Greenpeace France requested that the Conseil d'État:

1°) rule that judgement no 467982 of 10 May 2023 of the Conseil d'État, ruling as the Supreme Administrative Court, had not been fully enforced as of 30 June 2024;

2°) order the Prime Minister to take the additional measures necessary to ensure the full execution of decision no 467982 of 10 May 2023, within six months of the decision to be handed down, subject to a penalty for non-performance of €75 million per six-month period of delay, the payment of which shall be divided between the Haut Conseil pour le climat (High Council on Climate), the Agence de l'environnement et de la maîtrise de l'énergie (ADEME, Agency for Environment and Energy Management), the Office français de la biodiversité (OFB, French Biodiversity Agency), the Agence nationale de l'habitat (ANAH, National Housing Agency) and the Agence de financement des infrastructures de transport de France (AFIT France, French Transport Infrastructure Financing Agency).

3°) order the State to pay the sum of €5,000 under Article L. 761-1 of the French Code of Administrative Justice.

.....

Having regard to the other evidence adduced, including the evidence referred to in the Conseil d'État's rulings of 1st July 2020 and 10 May 2023;

Having regard to:

- the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change adopted on 9 May 1992 and the Protocol signed in Kyoto on 11 December 1997;
- the Paris Agreement adopted on 12 December 2015;
- Regulation (EU) 2018/842 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 30 May 2018;
- Regulation (EU) 2018/1999 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 11 December 2018;
- Regulation (EU) 2021/1119 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 30 June 2021;
- Regulation (EU) 2023/857 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 19 April 2023;
- the French Energy Code;
- the French Environmental Code;
- Decree no 2020-457 of 21 April 2020;
- the French Code of Administrative Justice;

Having heard, in open court:

- the report by Mr Cédric Fraisseix, Master of Petitions in extraordinary service,
- the legal opinion of Mr Nicolas Agnoux, Consultant Judge;

SCP Foussard, Froger, counsel for the municipality of Grande-Synthe and the City of Paris and SCP Guérin-Gougeon, counsel for the association Notre affaire à tous and others having addressed the court after the legal opinions;

Having regard to the post-hearing memorandum submitted by the municipality of Grande-Synthe, registered on 10 October 2025;

Whereas:

1. By decision no 427301 of 1st July 2021, the Conseil d'État, ruling as Supreme Administrative Court, firstly quashed the implicit refusal of the President of the French Republic, the Prime Minister and the Minister for the Ecological and Inclusive Transition, at the request of the municipality of Grande-Synthe, to take all useful measures to curb the greenhouse gas emissions produced in France in order to ensure compatibility with the greenhouse gas emission reduction targets set by Article L. 100-4 of the French Energy Code and Annex I of

Regulation (EU) 2018/842 of 30 May 2018 on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030 contributing to climate action in order to meet commitments under the Paris Agreement, and secondly, ordered the Prime Minister to take such measures before 31 March 2022.

2. By decision no 467982 of 10 May 2023, the Conseil d'État, ruled as Supreme Administrative Court on three applications for enforcement of decision no 427301 presented under the provisions of Articles L. 911-5 and R. 931-2 of the French Code of Administrative Justice, brought by the municipality of Grande-Synthe, the City Of Paris and the associations Notre affaire à tous, Oxfam France, Fondation pour la nature et l'homme and Greenpeace France. It firstly ordered the Prime Minister to take all useful supplementary measures to ensure that the pace of reduction of greenhouse gas emissions is consistent with the trajectory for reducing these emissions specified in Decree no 2020-457 of 21 April 2020 with a view to meeting reduction targets set by Article L. 100-4 of the Energy Code and by Annex I to Regulation (EU) 2018/842 of 30 May 2018 before 30 June 2024, and to produce, by 31 December 2023, then at the latest by 30 June 2024, all the elements proving the adoption of these measures and enabling the assessment of their impact on these greenhouse gas emission reduction targets. In the same decision, the Conseil d'Etat, ruling as the Supreme Administrative Court, dismissed the submissions seeking the imposition of a penalty for non-performance.

3. The Report, Studies and Cooperation Section carried out the procedures pursuant to the French Code of Administrative Justice, and the President of this section sent the President of the 6th Chamber of the Litigation Section a memorandum setting out the measures taken by the State to ensure the implementation of the aforementioned judgments of 1st July 2021 and 10 May 2023 of the Conseil d'État, ruling as the Supreme Administrative Court. The municipality of Grande-Synthe and the associations Notre affaire à tous, Oxfam France and Greenpeace France, objecting that these decisions had not been fully executed by 30 June 2024, requested that the Prime Minister be ordered to take the additional measures necessary to ensure such execution, subject to a penalty for non-performance.

Concerning the emissions targets applicable to France and the procedures for assessing the attainment of these targets:

4. Firstly, Article 4 of the aforementioned Regulation (EU) 2018-842 of 30 May 2018 provides as follows: *“1. Each Member State shall, in 2030, limit its greenhouse gas emissions at least by the percentage set for that Member State in Annex I in relation to its greenhouse gas emissions in 2005 (...).”* For the application of this article, Annex I to the Regulation sets the reduction target for greenhouse gas emissions, which is binding on France, at -37% by 2030 compared to their 2005 levels. Secondly, Article L. 100-4 of the French Energy Code provides as follows: *“I. - To respond to the ecological and climate emergency, the objectives of the national energy policy are: / 1° To reduce greenhouse gas emissions by 40% between 1990 and 2030 and to achieve carbon neutrality by 2050 by dividing greenhouse gas emissions by a factor of more than six between 1990 and 2050. The trajectory is specified in the carbon budgets mentioned in Article L. 222-1 A of the French Environment Code (...).”* It follows from these provisions that the French legislator has set a target of reducing greenhouse gas emissions by 40% by 2030 compared to 1990 levels.

5. Article L. 222-1 of the French Environment Code provides as follows: *“For the period 2015-2018, and then for each consecutive five-year period, a national cap on*

greenhouse gas emissions, known as the ‘carbon budget’, is set by decree.” Article L. 222-1 B of the same Code provides that: “I. – The national low-carbon development strategy, known as the ‘low-carbon strategy’, set by decree, defines the procedure to be followed to conduct the policy of mitigating greenhouse gas emissions under economically sustainable conditions in the medium and long term in order to meet the objectives defined by law in Article L. 100-1 of the Energy Code. (...) / II. – The decree setting the low-carbon strategy defines the carbon budget for each of the periods mentioned in Article L. 222-1 A by major sectors, in particular those in which France has made European or international commitments, by sector of activity as well as by greenhouse gas category. (...) / It also breaks down carbon budgets into indicative ranges of annual emissions. / (...) / The low-carbon strategy defines the cross-sector or sector-specific orientations and provisions established in order to meet the carbon budgets (...).” Article L. 222-1 C of the same code sets out the dates for publication of the carbon budgets for the periods 2015-2018, 2019-2023, 2024-2028 and 2029-2033.

6. Pursuant to Article L. 110-1 A of the Energy Code: “I.- Before 1st July 2023, and every five years thereafter, a law shall determine the objectives and set the priority measures in national energy policy in response to the ecological and climate emergency. / Each law referred to under the first paragraph of this Section shall specify: / 1° The greenhouse gas emission reduction targets for three successive five-year periods; (...); / 7° The programming of the financial resources required to attain the objectives (...). / I bis. - Each year, the Government shall submit to Parliament (...) a multi-annual strategy setting out the funding for the ecological transition and national energy policy. This strategy shall be compatible with the objectives mentioned in 1° to 6° of Section I of this article and with the programming of financial resources mentioned in point 7° of the same Section I. (...) / II.-The following shall be compatible with the objectives mentioned in I: / 1° The multi-annual energy programme referred to in Article L. 141-1; / 2° The national greenhouse gas emissions cap, known as the ‘carbon budget’, referred to in Article L. 222-1 A of the French Environment Code; / 3° The national low-carbon development strategy, known as the ‘low-carbon strategy’ (...); / 4° The integrated national energy and climate plan and the long-term strategy, referred to in Articles 3 and 15 respectively of Regulation (EU) 2018/1999 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 11 December 2018 on the governance of the Energy Union and climate action (...).”

7. Article 2 of the Decree of 21 April 2020 on national carbon budgets and the national low-carbon strategy sets the carbon budgets for the periods 2019-2023, 2024-2028 and 2029-2033, respectively, at 422, 359 and 300 MtCO₂e per year, excluding emissions and absorptions associated with the land use, land-use change and forestry (hereafter referred to as LULUCF) sector). Articles 3 to 5 define the arrangements for the allocation of these budgets by major sector, by field of activity and by greenhouse gas category. Article 6 specifies the indicative annual emissions shares, rounded off to the nearest 1 Mt CO₂e, for each of the second, third and fourth carbon budgets. As a result, for the second carbon budget, this indicative annual share, excluding the LULUCF sector, was 443 MtCO₂e for 2019, 436 MtCO₂e for 2020, 423 MtCO₂e for 2021, 410 MtCO₂e for 2022 and 397 MtCO₂e for 2023. In accordance with Article D. 222-1 B of the French Environment Code, this share was adjusted in 2025 to 445 MtCO₂e for 2019, 439 MtCO₂e for 2020, 426 MtCO₂e for 2021, 413 MtCO₂e for 2022 and 400 MtCO₂e for 2023. For the third carbon budget, this share is 384 MtCO₂e for 2024, 370 MtCO₂e for 2025, 358 MtCO₂e for 2026, 347 MtCO₂e for 2027 and 335 MtCO₂e for 2028. Finally, for the first two years of the fourth carbon budget, it is 323 MtCO₂e for 2029 and 310 MtCO₂e for 2030.

8. In addition, with Article 4 of Regulation (EU) 2021/1119 of 30 June 2021 establishing the framework for achieving climate neutrality, which came into force on July 2021,

i.e. after the Conseil d'État's decision no 427301 of 1st July 2021, the European Union approved a new net greenhouse gas emission reduction target, after the deduction of absorption, which is now set at -55% by 2030 compared with 1990 levels. The procedures for implementing this new overall target, notably by means of new targets applicable to each Member State, have been defined by the European Parliament and the Council of the European Union in the regulatory package known as "Fit for 55". In this context, Regulation (EU) 2023/857 of 19 April 2023 amended the above-mentioned Regulation (EU) 2018/842 of 30 May 2018, setting binding national targets for each Member State, notably in Annex I thereto. As a result, the greenhouse gas emission reduction target assigned to France, which was 37% for the period 2005-2030, has now been increased to 47.5% for the same period. To meet this objective, the Government has drawn up a draft third national low-carbon strategy – not yet adopted at the date of this decision – which aims to reduce emissions by 50% between 1990 and 2030. However, as the Conseil d'Etat's decision no 427301 of 1st July 2021 examined the legality of the challenged implicit refusal decisions in light of the objectives applicable on the date of the implicit refusal, i.e. 1st July 2021, the new European objective and its national versions cannot be considered to be applicable to the present litigation concerning the execution of the decisions of 1st July 2021 and 10 May 2023.

Concerning the execution of the decisions of 1st July 2021 and 10 May 2023:

9. It is incumbent upon the Conseil d'État, when ruling on the enforcement of judgements under Articles L. 911-5 and R. 931-2 of the French Code of Administrative Justice, to determine whether its decision has been correctly implemented, *ex officio* or at the request of one of the parties. If not, it is incumbent upon the Conseil d'Etat to issue new orders or to order a penalty to ensure the effective implementation of its judgement. In this case, the Government must, to demonstrate the correct implementation of the judgements of 1st July 2021 and 10 May 2023, provide evidence that the measures taken, as well as the measures that can still reasonably be adopted to produce effects within a sufficiently short space of time, ensure that the curve of the greenhouse gas emissions produced in the France is compatible with the attainment of the aforementioned greenhouse gas emission reduction targets set for 2030, as they stood on 1st July 2021, i.e. before the adoption of the "Fit for 55" package and the measures designed to implement it at national level. To determine whether this is the case, the execution judge takes into consideration all the information gathered during the adversarial preparatory stage that makes it possible to ensure, with a sufficient safety margin and taking account of forecasting and implementation uncertainties, that the targets set by the legislator will be able to be met. It is incumbent upon the judge, when ruling on the enforcement of judgements, firstly, to examine whether the intermediate targets have been met on the date of the ruling and under what conditions, taking account, where applicable, of any exogenous events that may have significantly affected the level of emissions recorded. Secondly, the judge ruling on the enforcement of judgements must take account of the measures adopted or announced by the Government and presented as being able to reduce greenhouse gas emissions, but also, where applicable, any measures liable, on the contrary, to generate a significant increase in emissions. Thirdly, the judge ruling on the enforcement of judgments must take into consideration the observed or foreseeable effects of these different measures and, more widely, the effectiveness of the public policies implemented, in light of the different methods of assessment or estimation available, including the opinions issued by experts, notably the High Council on Climate, to assess the compatibility of the greenhouse gas emission reduction trajectory with the targets assigned to France. In light of all these elements, the judge must finally determine, whether, in view of the effects already observed, the greenhouse gas emission reduction targets set for 2030 can, on the date of their decision, be considered as reasonably attainable, having regards to the

policies announced and the characteristics of the targets to be met as well as policy planning and coordination modalities of the planning and coordination of the public actions implemented. This analysis requires a dynamic perspective and should not be limited to the attainment of intermediate targets, but should take account of the targets set on the date of the judgement whose enforcement is disputed. If after completing this analysis, the judge ruling on the enforcement of a judgement considers that there is sufficient credible and substantiated evidence to consider the trajectory for meeting these targets as being respected, they may end the litigation relating to the enforcement of this judgement.

10. Firstly, it appears from the preparatory stages, and in particular from the annual report, known as “SECTEN”, published in June 2025 by the *Centre interprofessionnel technique d'études de la pollution atmosphérique* (CITEPA, French Interprofessional Centre for the Study of Atmospheric Pollution), that national greenhouse gas emissions, excluding the LULUCF sector, amounted to 436 MtCO₂e in 2019, compared with the adjusted indicative target of 445 MtCO₂e; 396 MtCO₂e in 2020, compared with the target of 439; 420 MtCO₂e in 2021, compared with the target of 426; 403 MtCO₂e in 2022, compared with the target of 413; and 376 MtCO₂e in 2023, compared with the target of 400. The average gross emissions level for the 2019-2023 stood at 406 Mt CO₂e, thereby reflecting compliance, within a favourable margin, with the second carbon budget, which provided, after adjustment, for an annual average of 425 Mt CO₂e. The aforementioned SECTEN report and the latest forecast published by CITEPA also show that the level of greenhouse gas emissions, excluding the LULUCF sector, was estimated at 369 Mt CO₂e in 2024, i.e. below the indicative annual share of the third carbon budget set at 384 Mt CO₂e, and at 366 Mt CO₂e in 2025, also below the indicative annual share set at 370 Mt CO₂e. It follows from all these factors that, on the date of this decision, the intermediate greenhouse gas emission reduction targets, as set out in the second and third carbon budgets of the second national low-carbon strategy, have been met.

11. Secondly, it is clear from the preparatory stages and notably from the oral hearing of 11 July 2025, in which the parties and the High Council on Climate participated, that the Government has, subsequent to the judgements of 1st July 2021 and 10 May 2023 of the Conseil d'Etat ruling as the Supreme administrative Court, adopted or initiated a significant and diversified set of measures with the aim of accelerating the rate of reduction of greenhouse gas emissions in the transport, building, agriculture, industry, energy and waste sectors, which it has been completed by the implementation of a territorial approach to ecological planning. The report also shows that substantial funding has been allocated to all these measures, with total investment in climate protection rising steadily from around €100 billion in 2022 to €105 billion in 2025. Whilst the applicants submit, conversely, that the provisions of the law of 11 August 2025 aimed at removing constraints on the practice of farming, or other provisions currently under consideration by Parliament, such as the abolition of low-emission zones (LEZs) or the easing of the “zero net artificialisation” rule, would encourage an increase in emissions or call into question the reduction measures adopted by the Government, it does not follow from the preparatory stages that the entry into force of these provisions, even supposing they were all adopted, would have a significant effect such as to prevent compliance with the greenhouse gas emission reduction targets at issue in the present dispute.

12. The applicants also submit that a significant delay has been incurred in the entry into force of several policies and pieces of legislation intended to steer public policies, with a view to achieving the objectives which, although not applicable to the present dispute, must be set at national level pursuant to Regulation (EU) 2023/857 of 19 April 2023. It thereby follows from the preparatory stages that although the State adopted the third national climate change

adaptation plan (Plan national d'adaptation au changement climatique, PNACC) in March 2025, neither the Programming Law provided for under Article L. 110-1 A of the Energy Code, nor the third editions of the national low-carbon strategy and the multi-annual energy plan had been promulgated or published as of the date of this ruling, notwithstanding that the national low-carbon strategy and the multi-annual energy programme were the subject of joint consultation conducted by the National Commission for Public Debate between 4 November and 16 December 2024 and that the latter was subject to two public consultation procedures, from 22 November to 22 December 2023 and from 7 March to 5 April 2025. However, it does not follow from the preparatory stages that the absence of the adoption, at the date of this decision, of these various instruments aimed at achieving the new targets imposed by Regulation (EU) 2023/857 of 19 April 2023 would, by itself, be such as to call into question the full execution of the decisions of 1st July 2021 and 10 May 2023.

13. Thirdly, it follows from the preparatory stages that, according to the forward-looking projection scenario known as “with existing measures” (WEM), which is produced by the Government and sent to the European Commission under Article 18 of Regulation (EU) 2018/1999 of 11 December 2018, taking account of the measures adopted up to 31 December 2023, greenhouse gas emissions from the six emitting sectors are expected to reach 326 Mt CO₂e in 2030, corresponding to a reduction of 39.5% compared with 1990, which is close to the target set under domestic law in Article L. 100-4 of the French Energy Code. Given, on the one hand, that this reduction in emissions in 2030 under the “WEM 2024” scenario is greater than the -37% estimated under the previous “WEM 2023” scenario, which considered existing measures up to 31 December 2021, and, on the other hand, the impact of new measures adopted or announced since 31 December 2023, the reduction in emissions should therefore exceed 39.5% by 2030.

14. Fourthly and finally, it follows in particular from the oral hearing held on 11 July 2025, as well as from the expert opinions available and notably from the work of the High Council on Climate, that the French rate of reduction of greenhouse gas emissions is, provided that it continues, estimated to be compatible with the attainment of the reduction targets set by the aforementioned Article L. 100-4 of the French Energy Code and Annex I to Regulation (EU) 2018/842 of 30 May 2018. Whilst it is true that, in its annual reports for 2024 and 2025, the High Council on Climate emphasises, with regard to the attainment of the 2030 targets under the European “Fit for 55” package, the inadequate coordination of certain measures implemented by the Government and notes that the rate of emission reduction is tending to slow and expresses concern about the delays observed in the adoption of the various planning documents, it nonetheless concludes that it is still possible to meet these targets, which are more demanding than those at issue in the present dispute, having regard to changes in the public policy action framework, the reduction in emissions recorded and the contribution of the main emitting sectors to this reduction.

15. It follows from all of the foregoing that as of the date of this decision, taking account of the various measures adopted by the Government, the greenhouse gas emission reduction targets set for 2030 under Article L. 100-4 of the French Energy Code and Annex I to Regulation (EU) 2018/842 of 30 May 2018 in its version prior to the entry into force of Regulation (EU) 2023/857 of 19 April 2023, at -40% compared with 1990 and -37% compared with 2005 respectively, can be considered reasonably attainable. Consequently, since, as of the date of this decision, sufficiently credible and substantiated elements are available to consider the trajectory towards the attainment of these targets as being on track, the judgements of the

Conseil d'Etat ruling as the Supreme Administrative Court of 1st July 2021 and 10 May 2023 must be regarded as having been fully enforced.

Concerning the application for an order and a penalty for non-performance:

16. In view of the foregoing, the claims for an order and a penalty payment must be dismissed.

Concerning the submissions made under Article L. 761-1 of the French Code of Administrative Justice:

17. Accordingly, in the circumstances of this case, it is appropriate to order the State to pay the sum of €3,000 to the municipality of Grande-Synthe and the aggregate sum of €3,000 to the associations Notre affaire à tous, Oxfam France et Greenpeace France to cover the costs of their legal representatives pursuant to Article L. 761-1 of the French Code of Administrative Justice.

OPERATIVE PROVISIONS:

Article 1: The decisions of the Conseil d'Etat, ruling as the Supreme Administrative Court, of 1st July 2021 and 10 May 2023 have been fully enforced.

Article 2: The French State shall pay the municipality of Grande-Synthe the sum of €3,000 and the associations Notre affaire à tous, Oxfam France et Greenpeace France an aggregate sum of €3,000 pursuant to Article L. 761-1 of the French Code of Administrative Justice.

Article 3: All the additional applications of the municipality of Grande-Synthe and the associations Notre affaire à tous, Oxfam France and Greenpeace France are dismissed.

Article 4: This decision shall be notified to the municipality of Grande-Synthe, the City of Paris, the associations Oxfam France, Greenpeace France and Notre affaire à tous, the Prime Minister and the Minister for the Ecological Transition, Biodiversity and International Climate and Nature Negotiations.

A copy thereof shall be sent to the Studies, Forward Studies and Cooperation Section.

Decision made following deliberations at the session held on 10 October 2025 at which sat: Mr Denis Piveteau, Deputy President of the Litigation Section, presiding; Ms Isabelle de Silva, Mr Jean-Philippe Mochon, Chamber Presidents; Mr Alain Seban, Ms Laurence Helmlinger, Mr Stéphane Hoyneck, Mr Christophe Pourreau, Mr Jean-Luc Matt, State Councillors and Cédric Fraisseix, Master of Petitions in Extraordinary Service-Reporting Judge.

Handed down on 24 October 2025.

The Presiding Judge:
Signed: Mr Denis Piveteau

The Reporting Judge:
Signed: Mr Cédric Fraisseix

The Secretary:
Signed: Ms Marie-Adeline Allain